

No. P-17024/23/2023-RC (FMS No. 384770)

**Government of India
Ministry of Rural Development
Department of Rural Development
(Rural Connectivity Division)**

Krishi Bhavan, New Delhi
Dated the 21st July, 2023

Minutes

Sub: Minutes of Meeting of Pre-Empowered Committee to discuss the project proposals for Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III) submitted by the State Government of Sikkim for the 2023-24 (Batch-I)-reg.

The undersigned is directed to enclose herewith the Minutes of the Pre Empowered Committee Meeting held on 17th July, 2023 under the chairmanship of Additional Secretary (RD) & DG, NRIDA through Video Conferencing to consider the project proposals submitted by State of Sikkim under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III), 2023-24 (Batch-I) for information and necessary action. The State Government is requested to furnish compliance on the observations of Pre EC on priority.

2. This issues with the approval of the competent Authority.



(Timan Singh)
Deputy Director (RC)

Distribution:

- (i) The Secretary, Rural Management and Development Department, Government of Sikkim, Gramin Prabhandak Vikas Bhawan, Vikas Bhawan, Gangtok, Sikkim-737103.
- (ii) Chief Engineer, Sikkim Rural Road Development Agency (SRRDA), Rural Development Department, Gram Vikas Bhawan, Gangtok-737102
- (iii) All Directors in National Rural Infrastructure Development Agency (NRIDA), 15 NBCC Tower, 5th Floor, Bhikaji Cama Place, New Delhi-110001.

Copy to:-

PPS to JS (RC)

Minutes of the Pre- Empowered Committee meeting held on 17th July 2023 at 04:00 PM to discuss the Project proposals submitted by the Government of Sikkim under PMGSY-III (Batch-I, 2023-24)

A Meeting of the Pre-Empowered Committee (Pre-EC) was held through Video Conference on 17th July 2023 at 04:00 PM under the Chairmanship of Additional Secretary (RD) & DG, NRIDA to discuss the project proposals submitted by the State of Sikkim under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III) for the year 2023-24 (Batch-I). The following officials were present in the meeting:-

Dr. Ashish Kumar Goel	Additional Secretary (RD), MoRD& DG, NRIDA
Shri Amit Shukla	Joint Secretary (RC), MoRD
Shri Devinder Kumar	Director (RC), MoRD
Shri B C Pradhan	Consultant/Director (Tech), NRIDA
Shri Pradeep Agrawal	Director (Projects-I), NRIDA
Dr. I.K. Pateriya	Director (Projects-III), NRIDA
Shri Nirmal Bhagat	Director (Finance), NRIDA
Shri Timan Singh	Deputy Director (RC), MoRD
State Govt. Representatives	
Mr. D. Anandan, I.A.S.	Commissioner/Secretary cum CEO, Rural Management and Development Department, Govt. of Sikkim
Mr Sanjeev Rai	Chief Engineer – I, Sikkim Rural Road Development Agency (SRRDA), Govt of Sikkim
Mr Rajiv Subba	Chief Engineer – II, SRRDA, Govt of Sikkim
Mr Raj Narayan Pradhan	Director (Accounts) cum FC, Govt of Sikkim.
Mr Bikash Rai	SQC, SRRDA, Govt of Sikkim
Mr Kiran Shrama	ITNO, SRRDA, Govt of Sikkim
Mr Nima Dopthapa	AE, SRRDA, Govt of Sikkim

2. Details of Proposal

The details of the proposal submitted by the State of Sikkim under PMGSY-III, Batch-I of 2023-24 are as under:-

Item	As per OMMAS as on 10.04.2023			
	Nos	Length (in km/m)	Cost (Rs in Crores)	Avg. Cost/km/m (Lakhs)
Roads	45	286.50	269.95	94.22
LSBs	-	-	-	-
Total	45 roads	286.5 km	269.95	94.22
* MoRD Share: Rs. 242.95 Crore			State share: Rs. 26.99 Crore	
Target: 287.50 km			Sanctioned: NIL	
			Balance Length: 286.50 km	

3. General Observations

(i) All proposals have been scrutinized on OMMAS by STA. The scrutiny of proposals is yet to be carried out by the PTA. State should ensure 10% PTA scrutiny of the proposals on OMMAS on priority and certainly before the EC meeting.

(ii) The current batch of proposals is for 45 road works of 286.50 km length in 3.75 m carriageway width category with average cost of Rs. 94.22 lakh/km.

(iii) State has apprised the Pre-EC that proposal for 18 nos of Long Span Bridges (LSBs) on these roads will be submitted within a month.

4. **Trace Map ranking**

Min. Trace Map Rank	Numbers of Proposals (%)
1 to 15	16 (36%)
16 to 50	17(38%)
51 to 100	8(18%)
>100	4(9%)
Total	45

All proposals of Trace Map rank of more than 50 have been audited on satellite imagery. 12 proposals are of trace map rank > 50. State should forward the detailed justification for the same, road wise.

5. **Planning Audit (Proposals)**

All the 45 road proposals are uploaded on GEOSADAK. Planning team of NRIDA audited 51 road proposals for their utility as TR/MRL under PMGSY-III. State has shifted 06 road proposals from current batch and done minor modification in the alignment for 01 proposal on the recommendation of planning team.

6. **Surface wise details of existing roads**

Out of total proposed length of 286.5 km in the current batch, 286.10 km is BT and 0.4 km is CC. All 45 roads have more than 95% BT/CC.

7. **High Priority Roads Skipped in CUCPL**

It was observed by the Pre-EC that 168 high-priority roads have been skipped citing different reasons. Pre-EC directed that State needs to examine and provide road wise justification with necessary documents proof for 17 roads where ownership is with another department and also for 05 roads which have road length less than 5 km. If these roads are of high utility then they should be taken up if otherwise eligible.

8. **Average Cost trends**

Average cost of road was Rs. 68.31 lakhs/km and Rs.86.52 lakhs/km at the time of sanction of PMGSY-I (2017-18) and PMGSY-II (2018-19) respectively and now it is Rs. 94.22 lakhs/km.

The State was advised to furnish the justification for increase in cost as elaborated in paras 10, 13 and 14.

9. **Length wise proposal details**

Out of 45 roads, 02 roads are of 2-3 km in length with an average cost of Rs. 91.90 lakh/km, 11 roads have road length 3-5 km with an average cost of Rs. 96.77 lakh/km and 32 roads have road length more than 5 km with an average cost of Rs. 93.82 lakh/km. State should justify the inclusion of 02 roads of length less than 5 Km in proposal. They should be verified on Geo Sadak whether they fulfill the objectives of PMGSY-III

10. Distribution of roads based on Traffic category

All the 45-road works of 286.50 km length are of 3.75 m carriageway width category. Out of total, 43 roads of length 269.40 km are in T5 category with average cost of Rs 92.53 lakh/km, 02 roads of length 17.10 km are in T9 category with average cost of Rs 120.92 lakh/km.

Pre-EC observed that average non pavement cost is very high. According to state, Sikkim being high rainfall area and hilly terrain, provision of line drains along the entire length of the road is essential for stability and longevity of roads. Due to this specific reason non pavement cost is high. State was advised to propose drain requirement near the habitation areas or at turns with steep gradient. State was requested to examine DPRs in consultation with NRIDA and suggest ways to bring down the cost while keeping the road technically correct. NRIDA will send team to the state for examination of DPRs and site.

11. Details of roads with PCU/day

09 roads have PCU less than 500, 35 roads have PCU between 500 and 1000 and 01 road has PCU between 1500 and 2000.

12. Distribution of roads based on widening of various carriageway widths

Pre-EC observed that the State has proposed widening of 07 roads from 3.00 to 3.75 m. State was requested to indicate the kind of procedure to be followed while doing widening of roads so as to have proper compaction and also explain the methodology of compaction for widened portion. According to NRIDA, State has taken CTB in all the 7 roads and therefore there should not be any issue regarding compaction.

13. Details of roads with pavement cost per km

NRIDA should examine the DPRs of 14 roads where pavement cost is more than 50 lakh/ km. and furnish proper justification along with breakdown details for the same road wise. NRIDA should also examine the cost of pavement (layer wise) and bring out the outliers. New technology solutions, such as cement stabilization may be considered to bring down the cost, while improving performance.

14. Details of roads with non-pavement cost per km

Pre EC observed that most of the roads (43 roads) have high non-pavement cost more than 35 lakh/km. State is advised to examine the DPRs in consultation with NRIDA, provide detailed justification and suggest ways to bring down the cost.

15. DPR Issues (Roads)

- (i) 3rd party traffic verification should be done by the State adopting ATCC for traffic considered more than 1 MSA as per recent advisory and the reports should be attached with the DPRs.
- (ii) State should ensure that the design stage Road Safety Audit has been done for all the proposed roads of length more than 5 km and the reports should be attached with the DPRs ensuring appropriate compliance to the recommendation made in the report.
- (ii) Pucca drain needs to be proposed only in Built-up area. State proposed pucca drain in open area also.
- (iv) State is taking hard shoulder of GSB material to a depth of 300 mm needs to be restricted to 100mm and 1m width on both side.

(v) As carriageway width is 3.75m the central line needs to be deleted only edge line needs to be provided.

(vi) Cost of CTSB and CTB are taken same and needs to be rechecked.

(vii) Credit for existing Crust has not been considered in CTSB.

16. New Technology Proposals

State has proposed construction of roads using New/ Green technologies as under:

(i) State has not proposed waste plastic in 70% of the eligible length involving Hot Mix. State apprised Pre EC that due to banning of plastic in the State it is not feasible for them to use waste plastic in hot mix.

(ii) State has not proposed Cold Mix in 25% of the eligible length. According to State being high rainfall area, cold mix technology is not proposed.

(iii) State has proposed entire flexible pavement length having Traffic category less than or equal to T9 with 25 mm MSS.

(iv) State has proposed 7.40 km of road length using Panelled Cement Concrete.

(v) State has proposed 222 km length using CTB.

17. Maintenance

The State has proposed a 5-year routine maintenance cost of Rs. 2159.63lakh which is 8% of construction cost and 6th year renewal cost of Rs. 4859.10lakh which is 18% of construction cost. State has been advised that 6th year's renewal cost should be accompanied by a post 5-year routine maintenance period and such cost should be a part of the DPRs.

18. Progress of PMGSY works

For the year 2023-24, annual target of the State is 250 Km, out of which, only 04 Km has been completed. State needs to complete balance target in a time bound manner. The details of work sanctioned, completed and pending under PMGSY-I and II are given below.

Roads

S. No	Scheme	Sanctioned		Completed		Balance	
		No. of Roads	Length (Km)	No. of Roads	Length (Km)	No. of Roads	Length (km)
1	PMGSY I	961	4794.50	882	4500.34	79	232.31
2	PMGSY II	34	120.99	24	110.50	10	9.46
Total:		995	4915.49	906	4610.84	89	241.77

LSBs

S.No	Scheme	Sanctioned (Nos.)	Completed (Nos.)	Balance (Nos.)
1	PMGSY I	99	57	42
2	PMGSY II	0	0	0
Total:		99	57	42

According to State due to heavy rains some of the roads have been damaged badly, which will be proposed for foreclosure, rest all works under PMGSY-I& II will be completed by March, 2024. State was advised to send proposal for the foreclosure/dropping of the works on priority, if any.

19. Maintenance of roads under DLP

During 2022-23, State has credited Rs.1.18 crore against the liability of Rs. 7.65 crore and expenditure of Rs. 2.18 crore has been done. For the current financial year 2023-24, the maintenance liability is Rs. 8.68 crore and expenditure of Rs. 2.02 crore has been incurred. Pre-EC observed that approximately 30% expenditure has been incurred on maintenance corresponding to their maintenance liability. State was asked to put more efforts to increase the expenditure on maintenance of roads and to credit required maintenance liability for the year 2023-24 in the SRRDA's account on priority.

State has not carried out any renewal of road during 2022-23. State was requested to look into it and increase the pace of renewal.

20. eMARG

Out of total 166 packages pushed to e-MARG, 6 packages are pending for locking, 13 packages are pending for manual entry expenditure (MEE). 70 roads are eligible for routine inspection in June, 2023, 4 roads (5.71%) are pending for routine inspection (RI) missed. 99 packages are pending for payment for >3 months. 58 packages are pending for payment for first payment for > 3 months. Payment of Rs. 1.819crore has been done using e-MARG in FY 2023-24. Total expenditure of Rs. 0.036 crore has been done on bills having liability of FY 2023-24.

The State was asked to saturate 100% roads on eMARG before EC. It was also suggested to do all the RI on time without failing.

21. Quality

(i) Out of 87 ongoing packages, QC labs have not been established in 01 package. State was asked to take action on priority.

(ii) There are 02 works which have not been inspected by SQMs even once. These should be inspected immediately and certainly before Empowered Committee (EC) meeting.

(iii) Number of active SQMs are 10 against the requirement of 4. During 2023-24, against the target of 222 SQM inspections, 42 inspections have been carried out so far.

(iv) Action Taken Report (ATR) in respect of 18 ATRs (ongoing works) are pending at State Level. Out of these, 04 ATRs are pending for more than 02 years. **Pre-EC directed that State should show substantial compliance for these pending ATRs before EC meeting.**

(v) **Unsatisfactory grading by NQM from July, 2020 to June, 2023** for completed works is 13.04 %, for ongoing works it is 7.65%, for maintenance works it is 71.43% and for bridge works it is 10.26% which is quite unsatisfactory. The unsatisfactory grading by NQM from **July, 2022 to June, 2023** for completed works is 14.29%, for ongoing works, it is 9.38% and for bridge works it is 10.81%. The State was advised to take immediate corrective action and show some improvement in the aforesaid indicators.

(vi) Similarly, unsatisfactory grading by SQM from **July, 2020 to June, 2023** for completed works is **0.00%**, for ongoing works it is **5.36%**, for maintenance works, it is 19.05% and for bridge works it is 3.91% The unsatisfactory grading by SQM from **July, 2022 to June, 2023** for completed works is **0.00%**, for ongoing works it is **6.35%**, for maintenance works it is **33.33%** and for bridge works it is 0.00%.

(vii) **There is high variation in the unsatisfactory grading of NQM and SQM.**

(viii) Pre-EC has observed that out of 76 ongoing works, QCR is uploaded of 73 works. **State is asked to upload QCR of all works without delay.** State is also suggested that proper test should be done to maintain the quality where QCR is not uploaded.

(ix) It was observed that SQMs empanelled by the State have graded only one work 'Unsatisfactory' out of the projects inspected by them. The State is advised to scrutinize and find out whether the performance of SQMs is satisfactory. **State is also advised to depute SQMs from other states for inspection.**

Pre-EC directed the State to improve the performance of State Quality Control Mechanism. State is asked to upload all QCR on OMMAS. Pre-EC directed the State that EC meeting for current batch will be held only after State shows considerable improvement in Quality Control Mechanism.

22. Finance Issues

(i) interest recovery of Rs. 1.75 crore is pending from bank.

(ii) 13 works are pending for financial closure for more than 180 days.

The State was asked to look into these financial issues and take appropriate action on priority.

23. The State was asked to furnish the compliance report on the observations of the Pre-Empowered Committee urgently so that the proposal could be placed before the Empowered Committee at the earliest possible.

Meeting ended with Vote of Thanks to and from the chair.
