

No. P-17024/22/2019-RC (FMS No. 369629)

**Government of India
Ministry of Rural Development
Department of Rural Development**

Krishi Bhavan, New Delhi
Dated the 29th September, 2023

Minutes

Sub: Minutes of the Meeting of the Empowered Committee held on 18th September, 2023 to consider the project proposals submitted by Government of Rajasthan under PMGSY III, Batch- I, 2023-24 -reg.

The undersigned is directed to enclose herewith a copy of the Minutes of the Meeting of the Empowered Committee held on 18th September, 2023 through Video Conferencing to consider the project proposals submitted by the State Government of Rajasthan under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III, Batch-I, 2023-24).

2. The State Government is requested to furnish compliance report on the observations of the EC on priority.



(U. K. Nair)

Director (RC)

Email: uk.nair64 @gov.in

Distribution:

- i. The Principal Secretary, PWD Main Building room no 5225, Secretariat, Govt. of Rajasthan, Jaipur.
- ii. The Secretary PWD, Secretariat, SSO Building, Room No. 8118, Govt of Rajasthan, Jaipur.
- iii. The Chief Engineer, RRRDA.
- iv. The Adviser (RD), NITI Aayog, NITI Aayog Bhawan, Sansad Marg, New Delhi.
- v. The Director, Central Roads Research Institute, Mathura Road, New Delhi.
- vi. The secretary General, Indian Road Congress, Kama Koti Marg, Ranjit Nagar, Sector-6, R.K. Puram, New Delhi-110037.
- vii. The Chief Engineer, Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Parivahan Bhavan, New Delhi
- viii. All Directors in National Rural Infrastructure Development Agency (NRIDA), 15 NBCC Tower, 5th Floor, Bhikaji Kama Place, New Delhi- 110001.

Copy for information to:-

PS to Hon'ble MRD/ PS to Hon'ble MoS (RD)/ PSO to Secretary (RD)/ PPS to JS (RC)/ PPS to JS &FA.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EMPOWERED COMMITTEE HELD ON 18th SEPTEMBER, 2023 TO CONSIDER THE PROJECT PROPOSALS SUBMITTED BY THE STATE OF RAJASTHAN UNDER PMGSY-III, (BATCH-I, 2023-24)

A Meeting of the Empowered Committee was held through Video Conferencing on 18th September, 2023 under the Chairmanship of Secretary, Department of Rural Development to consider the project proposals submitted by the State of Rajasthan under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III) (Batch-I) of 2023-24. Following officers were present in the meeting:-

Shri Shailesh Kumar Singh	Secretary, DoRD
Ms. Tanuja Thakur Khalkho	Joint Secretary & FA, DoRD
Shri Amit Shukla	Joint Secretary (RC), DoRD & DG, NRIDA
Shri U.K. Nair	Director (RC)
Shri Pradeep Agrawal	Director(P.I), NRIDA
Ms. R. Krishna Kumari	Under Secretary, RC Division
State Govt. Representatives	
Shri Vaibhav Galriya	Principal Secretary (PWD), Govt. of Rajasthan
Shri Sunil Jai Singh	Chief Engineer, PMGSY
Shri Sanwar Mal	Financial Advisor
Shri Kaushlendra Bhardwaj	Superintendent Engineer, PMGSY
Shri Anil Mathur	SQC, PMGSY
Shri D. K. Shrivastav	Superintendent Engineer, Didwana
Shri T. R. Fidoda	Superintendent Engineer, Nagaur
Smt. Rink Jain	ITNO cum Executive Engineer (PMGSY)

2. Details of Proposal

Item	As per PRE-EC				As per OMMAS dated 13-09-2023			
	No	Length (in km/m)	Cost (Rs in Crores)	Avg. Cost per km/m (Lakhs)	No	Length (in km/m)	Cost (Rs in Crores)	Avg. Cost per km/m (Lakhs)
Roads	38	435.040	280.94	64.57	38	435.040	277.74	63.84
Total	38 roads	435.040 km roads	280.94	64.57	38 roads	435.040 km roads	277.74*	63.84
* MORD share Rs. 166.64 crore					State Share Rs. 111.09 crore			

- The State of Rajasthan has been allocated target length of 8,662.50 Km under PMGSY-III, out of which, State has already been sanctioned 8,221.76 km and 440.74 Km remains to be sanctioned. The current proposal is for 38 roads of 435.040 Km for Rajasthan.
- Average cost in 5.5 m carriageway width category is Rs. 63.84 lakh/Km.

- III. All proposals have been uploaded and scrutinized by the STAs on OMMAS. Also these roads have been scrutinized by PTAs.

3. Planning

(i) Trace Map Cut-Quality of roads

Trace Map Rank	Numbers of Proposals	%
1 to 15	27	71%
16 to 50	11	29%
Total	38	

Trace Map rank of the proposals is found satisfactory.

(ii) Planning Audit (Proposals) and existing surface details

All 38 road proposals have been uploaded on GEOSADAK. All proposals were audited for their utility as TR/MRL under PMGSY-III by NRIDA team.

The approximate length of the existing surface of the roads proposed in the current batch, as intimated by the State representative during the meeting is as under:-

Brick soiling	Moorum	Track	Gravel	WBM	BT	CC	Total
0.0	0.0	7.1	19.06	19.7	386.015	3.165	435.04

Out of 38 roads proposed in the current batch, in 30 roads 95-100% of the existing surface is BT/CC, in 1 road work 75-85% of the existing surface is BT/CC, in 4 road works 50-75% of the existing surface is BT/CC, in 2 road works 25-50 % of the existing surface is BT/CC and in remaining 1 road, the proportion of BT/CC is less than 25%. The State was asked to furnish detailed justification in respect of all 7 roads with length of Non BT/CC portion more than 25% as to how they meet objectives of PMGSY-III. The State in its response apprised the EC about the utility of these proposals, as follows :

- T05-Hadetar to Pathmeda Jaliyanadi Luniyasar to NH 168 A: This intra-state through-route links habitations & higher secondary schools of various villages like Pathmeda, Parthvameda, Looniyasar, Hadetar directly to NH-168A and "Krishi Upaj Mandi Nainawa, Gujarat" situated just 1 km away from the end point of this route.
- T02-Karkedi Dhadhota Beesas Bajwas Modi Khurd Nimbola Bhawanigaon Barev Chitai Lalana Kallan Harnawa Kuchipala Block Border: The traffic and movement of agriculture products of villages Rid, Netiyas, Bajwas, Peelwa, Bherwas & Bisas utilizes this shortest route to approach to MDR-191, then SH-21A & SH-7 to Krishi Mandi, FCI Godown, Railway Station, CHC at Parbatsar.

- c. T01-Hindwara Gomi Ratura Hotigaon Agrawa up to Bharatmala : The through route connects many habitations and revenue village such as Hindwara, Gomi, Ratura, Hotigaon, Shivrpura, Agrawa and higher secondary schools of district Jalore directly to NH-925A and district Barmer across the Looni (Salty) river basin. This through route links head of emergengy landing air strip AGRAWA NH-925 of Indian Air Force. When the air strip is unavailable for movement, then this route is most useful for public transport as well as of defence forces.
- d. T07-Dadrewa - Meethi Patt - Leelki - Jodhawas - Dantli - Birmi Khalsa: This road connects major Krishi Mandi Rajagrah, Bhadra and Shawa (Taranagar). It provides shortest route from Dadrewa to Gogamedi (Religious tourist place) (25Km). It is a major through route to connect SH-06 to MDR-339. This road is also listed as a non-patchable category road. This road connects more than 15 Gram Panchyat to Government Colleges, Banks, Hospitals, Railway Station and other important facilities of Block Rajgarh.
- e. T14-Bharnawa-Sandas to Gorau Block Boundary: . This route is discontinuous in village Bharnawa Sandas & Gorau since good condition CC roads exist in these villages which was constructed in year 2016 to 2018 under State Village Gaurav Path scheme. In State budget announcement 2023-24, major link route has been sanctioned for 22 km from village Jhardiya- Sandas- Malegaon- Genana- Baldoo- Sanwrad upto SH-7 Mega highway. This road also inter connects SH-7D, NH-458 and NH-52. The traffic of villages Bharnawa, Gorau, Kashipura, Rotoo etc. utilizes this proposed route to reach SH-7D, NH-458 and NH-52 for nearest Krishi Mandies, Railway Stations, CHCs and Market Centre at Ladnun &Didwana.
- f. T13-SH-90 to Mangalwa Seeniya Gothri Nawad Dhandhanwa RaithaliyaChindaliya Chandi Ladpur Gelasar Ladriya Block Border: The State informed that portion of road from SH-90 to Mangalwa Seeniya Gothri Nawad Dhandhanwa Raithaliya Chindaliya upto Chandi is having PCI index more than 2; the State is not interested in riding surface improvement. Agriculture products of village Chandi, Ladpur, Gelasar travel on this shortest route to nearest Krishi Mandi Kuchaman.MDR-181 chainage 0/0 to village Ladpur chainage 3/300 having length 3.30 km which is Newly constructed WBM road in MNREGA and chainage 3/300 to 8/0 old BT road, total 8.0 km. Further, Km 8/0 (village Gelasar) to km 13/0 (village Ladriya) has been sanctioned in State scheme.
- g. T11-Bhakri Kurada- Ratnas-Beethwaliya Mehrasi upto SH-59 : Villages situated on south side of Bhakri village use VR-145 to reach Degana City. Villages along MDR 181 situated on North side of Bhakri village would use this proposed route to reach Degana town to avoid the conjunction of traffic movement in village Bhakri & Jawla. Traffic of village Kurada, Gular, Chitai and Chitawa utilizes this shortest route to nearest Krishi Mandi, Junction Railway Station, CHC, NH-458 and

Market Centre at Degana for further movement to District head quarter Nagaur.

The Empowered Committee desired that the matter be examined as per the PMGSY guidelines.

Accordingly, the matter was examined. As per para 2.5 of Programme Guidelines (PMGSY III), *" The program will focus on upgradation of existing Through Routes and Major Rural Links based on priority giving importance to critical facilities like the rural markets and education & health facilities. However, new construction may be allowed only as a part of upgradation project to connect Gramin Agricultural Markets(GrAMs)/warehouses, Government hospitals and Educational Institutions, in case they are not connected already with a metalled road or require strengthening and widening of existing roads."*

NRIDA has noted that for roads at (b), (e) (f) and (g) , the non BT/CC/WBM portion of the road with respect to Core Network length are zero, these proposals are eligible as per PMGSY guidelines and for roads at (a), (c) and (d) are concerned, the non BT/CC/WBM portion of these roads with respect to Core Network length are 51%, 60% and 64% respectively, hence these proposals may not fulfill the objectives of the PMGSY guidelines as they seem to be largely new constructions rather than upgradation. State is advised to undertake these three projects under any of its scheme.

4. High Priority Roads Skipped in CUCPL

With regard to 135 road works of High Priority which have been skipped, State furnished the following justifications:

- i. For 73 road works ,the State is not interested in riding surface improvement,
- ii. 22 roads are sanctioned under State Scheme but under construction.
- iii. 21 road works have been constructed under state scheme and are under DLP,
- iv. In case of 8 roads, proposable road length is very short,
- v. 7 road works under PMGSY DLP
- vi. 3 roads cannot be taken up due to land issues
- vii. In case of 1 road, ownership is with different department

These were taken into account by the EC.

5. Traffic wise details of roads

- (i) In 5.50 m carriageway width, 2 roads of length 26.56 Km are in T7 traffic category with average pavement cost of Rs. 49.61 lakh/km, average non-

pavement cost of Rs. 13.95 lakh/km and average total cost of Rs. 63.56 lakh/Km.

(ii) In 5.50 m carriageway width, 36 road of length 408.48 km are in T9 category with average pavement cost of Rs. 59.78 lakh/km, average non-pavement cost of Rs. 4.08 lakh/km and average total cost of Rs. 63.86 lakh/Km.

After the preEC NRIDA had been requested to undertake examination of few DPRs of high cost. There is a saving of Rs. 3.2 crores in the proposals coming before the EC. The State also informed that the proposals are based on SOR 2022-23 approved by NRIDA.

6. PCU value

The PCU of 38 roads proposed in the current batch are as under:-

PCU/day details		
S.No	PCU/day	No of Roads
		5.5 m
1	2000-2500	3
2	2500-3000	1
3	3000-3500	-
4	3500-4000	9
5	>4000	25
Total		38

This was considered as acceptable by NRIDA.

7. Distribution of roads based on widening of various carriageway

Categories of Upgradation	No.	Length (km)	Avg. Pav Cost (Lakhs/KM)	Avg. Total Cost (Lakhs/KM)
3.75-5.5	37	430.04	59	63.66
3-5.5	1	5	72.72	79.46
Total	38	435.04	59.16	63.84

8. Pavement cost/km wise details:-

The details of proposals are as under:-

Sl. No.	Pavement cost/km	No. of roads
		5.5 m
1	<50 Lakhs	1
2	50-55	2
3	55-60	17
4	60-65	16
5	70-75	1
Total		38

Pavement cost of 37 roads are more than 50 lakh/Km. **After the preEC NRIDA had been requested to undertake examination of few DPRs of high cost. There is a saving of Rs. 3.2 crores in the proposals coming before the EC.**

9. Non pavement cost/km wise details:

The details of proposals are as under:-

Sl No	Non Pavement cost/km	No. of roads
		5.5 m
1	<20Lakhs/km	38

Non-pavement cost of all 38 roads in current batch is less than 20 lakh/Km which appears to be reasonable.

10. General observations

SI No.	Observations	Compliance	NRIDA Comments
1.	State is requested to send the DPRs to NRIDA as Pavement cost is more than Rs. 50 lakhs/km.	The State has already submitted the said DPRs in persons to NRIDA after Pre-EC.	NRIDA proposed some changes and State make the correction on OMMAS and there is saving of 3.2 crores after Pre EC.
2.	State should also carry out axle load survey and traffic survey (ATCC) for all T9 roads and share the same with NRIDA in the compliance	The state has submitted ATCC and Axle Load Survey report for all T9 roads.	State submitted the ATCC and Axle Load Survey report to NRIDA

The EC accepted the comments of NRIDA.

11. R & D Proposals

- I. State representative intimated that 351.38 Km road length has been proposed using Waste Plastic, which is 88.86% of the proposal.
- II. 17.58 km (68.06%) under T6 to T8 are proposed using Mechanized Surface Dressing.
- III. 39.625 km (103.45) is proposed using panelled cement concrete/ white topping/ cell filled concrete, against provision of 100% of proposed length under Cement Concrete in terms of New Technology Vision, 2022.
- IV. 403.665 km road length is proposed with OGPC.

12. Maintenance

State has proposed Rs. 1,530.43 lakh for 5 years Routine maintenance, which is 5.51% of the construction cost and agreeable. Similarly, for 6th year renewal

cost is Rs. 5,703.52 lakh, which is of 20.53% of the construction cost which is agreeable.

13. Progress of PMGSY works

The status of implementation of PMGSY-I, II and III in the State are as under:-

Road length in Km

Scheme	Sanctioned		Completed		Balance		Unawarded	
	No. of roads	Length (Km)	No. of roads	Length (Km)	No. of Roads	Length (km)	No. of Road	Length (km)
PMGSY I	16,804	66,045.98	16,804	63,772.66	0	0	0	0
PMGSY II	401	3,464.26	401	3,468.62	0	0	0	0
PMGSY III	878	8,205.37	589	5,705.05	289	2,448.17	45	400.3
Total	18,083	77,715.62	17,794	72,946.35	289	2,448.18	45	400.30

Bridge (No.)

Sl. No	Scheme	Sanction (Nos.)	Completed (Nos.)	Balance (Nos.)	Unawarded (Nos.)
1	PMGSY I	26	26	0	0
2	PMGSY II	6	6	0	0
3	PMGSY III	41	6	35	21
Total:		73	38	35	21

The State should award all the roads and bridges at the earliest.

14. Physical Progress 2023-24 (as on 18.09.2023)

The State has made an achievement of 91 Km only, against targets for construction of 1,600 Km during FY 2023-24. The State should expedite the pace of award and execution to achieve the target.

15. eMARG

Total 1,339 packages are pending for locking and 1,316 package pending for MEE. During FY 2023-24, out of 2,570 road works eligible for Routine Inspection (RI), 265 road works (10.31%) have missed RI. Out of 594 road works eligible for Routine Inspection (RI) in the month of August, 2023, 91 road works (15.31%) missed RI in the month of August, 2023. 670 packages are pending for payment for more than 3 months. 575 packages are pending for first payment. While the State has incurred an expenditure of Rs. 26.76 crore

using eMARG during 2023-24 on roads under DLP, the total expenditure done on bills having liability of FY 2023-24 is Rs. 3.31 crore, which is miniscule and only 12.36 % of total expenditure incurred during 2023-24.

Total RI missed during the current FY is 594. State is directed to undertake RI on regular basis and not to bring down RI to zero.

16. PMGSY-III Awarded road works-tendering analysis

Out of total 834 awarded works under PMGSY-III, 774 awarded works are awarded below the sanctioned amount. Out of these 774 works, 274 works have been awarded at less than 30% below the sanctioned cost, 149 works at 24-30% below the sanctioned cost, 140 works at 18-24% below sanctioned cost, 90 works at 12-18% below sanctioned cost, 66 works at 6-12% below sanctioned cost, 56 works at 0-6% below the sanctioned cost.

53 works are awarded above the sanctioned amount. Out of these 53 works, 38 works are awarded at 0-6% above the sanctioned cost, 7 works are awarded at 6-12% above the sanctioned cost, 2 roads are awarded at 12-18% above the sanctioned cost, 2 roads are awarded at 18-24% above the sanctioned cost and 4 roads are awarded at more than 30% above the sanctioned cost.

The State was asked to ensure additional visits of State Quality Monitors on the low quoted PMGSY works so that these works are completed with good quality, in terms of advisory dated 3rd March, 2022 issued by NRIDA.

17. Quality Control

- I. Out of 232 packages in progress, labs for 150 packages have not been established. These should be established immediately.
- II. Against the requirement of 24 SQMs, 73 SQMs are in position in the State.
- III. Against the target of 1,300 SQM inspections during the current financial year, only 180 inspections have been carried out so far.
- IV. **Unsatisfactory % based on NQM inspections (September' 2020-August' 2023)**
 - Completed Works - 1.02 % - 196 Completed works inspected
 - Ongoing Works -3.00% - 534 Ongoing works inspected
 - Maintenance works - 9.27% - 151 Maintenance Works Inspected
 - Bridge works- 33.33% - 3 maintenance works inspected
- V. 7 ATRs of completed works and 9 ATRs of Ongoing works at pending from State Government.

State is requested to instruct SRRDA to take urgent action to complete the pending ATR failing which State may initiate disciplinary and legal action, as required.

18. Status of Complaints:

Action Taken Reports (ATR) in respect of two complaints pertaining to poor condition of road works, irregularities in construction of works, etc. are still awaited. The State was asked to expedite the same **and report may be furnished at the earliest .**

19. SQM Analysis :

It was noticed during the meeting that SQMs empanelled by the State have graded very few works 'Unsatisfactory' out of the large number of projects inspected by them. The State was advised to scrutinize and find out whether the performance of such SQMs satisfactory.

20. Finance Issues:

- I. Internal audit has not been conducted till date. This may be expedited.
- II. Interest recovery of Rs. 57.84 crore is pending from bank. The State was asked to ensure the same at earliest.
- III. 09 works are pending for financial closure for more than 180 days. These may be looked into urgently.
- IV. Audited Balance Sheet of all the three funds for FY 2022-23 is required to be submitted by 30-09-2023.

21. Recommendations of Empowered Committee

Subject to the above observations and concurrent action/compliance by the State government as stipulated in the foregoing paras, the Empowered Committee recommended the above proposals as at para-2 above.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

