

No.P-17024/22/2019-RC (FMS No. 369629)
Government of India
Ministry of Rural Development
Department of Rural Development

Krishi Bhavan, New Delhi
Dated the 16th November, 2022

Minutes

Sub: Minutes of the Meeting of the Empowered Committee held on 09th November, 2022 to consider the project proposals submitted by Government of Rajasthan under PMGSY III, Batch- II, 2022-23-reg.

The undersigned is directed to enclose herewith a copy of the Minutes of the Meeting of the Empowered Committee held on 09th November, 2022 through Video Conferencing to consider the project proposals submitted by the State Government of Rajasthan under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III, Batch-II, 2022-23).

2. The State Government is requested to furnish compliance report on the observations of the EC on priority.



(Lalit Kumar)

Deputy Secretary to the Government of India

Tel. No. 2338 2406

Distribution:

- i. The Principal Secretary, PWD Main Building room no 5225, Secretariat, Govt. of Rajasthan, Jaipur.
- ii. The Secretary PWD, Secretariat, SSO Building, Room No. 8118, Govt of Rajasthan, Jaipur.
- iii. The Chief Engineer, RRRDA.
- iv. The Adviser (RD), NITI Aayog, NITI Aayog Bhawan, Sansad Marg, New Delhi.
- v. The Director, Central Roads Research Institute, Mathura Road, New Delhi.
- vi. The secretary General, Indian Road Congress, Kama Koti Marg, Ranjit Nagar, Sector-6, R.K. Puram, New Delhi-110037.
- vii. The Chief Engineer, Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Parivahan Bhavan, New Delhi
- viii. All Directors in National Rural Infrastructure Development Agency (NRIDA), 15 NBCC Tower, 5th Floor, Bhikaji Kama Place, New Delhi- 110001.

Copy for information to:-

PS to Hon'ble MRD/PS to Hon'ble MoS (RD)/ PSO to Secretary (RD)/ PPS to AS (RD)/ PPS to AS &FA.

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EMPOWERED COMMITTEE HELD ON 09TH NOVEMBER, 2022 TO CONSIDER THE PROJECT PROPOSALS SUBMITTED BY THE STATE OF RAJASTHAN UNDER PMGSY-III, (BATCH-II, 2022-23)

A Meeting of the Empowered Committee was held through Video Conferencing on 9th November, 2022 under the Chairmanship of Secretary, Department of Rural Development to consider the project proposals submitted by the State of Rajasthan under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III) (Batch-II) of 2022-23. Following officials were present in the meeting:-

Shri Nagendra Nath Sinha	Secretary, DoRD
Shri Shailesh Kumar Singh	Officer on Special Duty, OSD (RD)
Dr Ashish Kumar Goel	Additional Secretary, (RD), DoRD & DG, NRIDA
Shri. B. C. Pradhan	Consultant (Tech), NRIDA
Dr. I. K. Pateriya	Director (P.II&III), NRIDA
Shri Pradeep Agarwal	Director (P.I), NRIDA
Shri Lalit Kumar	Deputy Secretary, MoRD
State Govt. Representatives	
Shri Vaibhav Galriya	Principal Secretary (PWD)
Shri Sunil Jai Singh	Chief Engineer, PMGSY
Shri R.S. Jatoliya	Financial Advisor
Shri Kaushlendra Bhardwaj	Superintendent Engineer, PMGSY
Shri Anil Kumar Mathur	SQC
Smt. Rink Jain	ITNO cum Executive Engineer (PMGSY)
Smt. Shalini Garg	Executive Engineer

2. Details of Proposal

As per Pre EC					Current proposal as per OMMAS as on 01.05.2022			
Item	No of Roads	Length (in Km)	Cost (Rs in Crore)	Avg. Cost/km (Lakhs)	No of Roads/LSB	Length	Cost (Rs in Crore)	Avg. Cost
Roads	282	2460.51	1672.30	67.96	279	2489.067	1610.83	64.72
LSBs	36	3649	194.15	5.32	35	3369	200.9	5.96
Total	282 roads + 36 LSBs	2460.51 km roads + 3649 m LSBs	1866.46		279 roads + 35 LSBs	2489.067 km roads + 3369 m LSBs	1811.73	

***MoRD Share: Rs. 1086.97 crore**

State Share : Rs. 724.76 crore

- The State of Rajasthan has been allocated a target of 8,662.50 km under PMGSY-III. The State has already been sanctioned 5,852.41 Km and 2,810.09 km remains to be sanctioned. The current batch of proposals submitted by the State includes 279 roads of 2,489.067 km and 35 LSBs worth Rs. 1,811.73 crore.
- All the proposals uploaded on OMMAS are scrutinized by STA. 42 road proposals and 3 LSBs are also scrutinized by PTA.

- (iii). The state has proposed 102 roads in 3.75 m carriageway width at an average cost of Rs 51.54 lakh/km and 177 roads in 5.50 m carriageway width at an average cost of Rs. 71.24 lakh/km.
- (iv). The Committee observed that at the time of Pre-EC meeting, 282 roads of 2,460.51 Km were proposed for consideration. Now, the number of roads has reduced to 279, but the length of roads have increased to 2,489.067 Km. The State was asked to indicate the reasons for the same.
- (v). The average cost of the roads of 3.75 m carriageway width has increased from Rs. 43.64 lakh/Km in 2020-21 (PMGSY-III) to Rs. 51.54 lakh/Km and that of 5.50 m carriageway width from Rs. 59.85 lakh/km to Rs. 71.24 lakh/Km. The State representative attributed the increase to increase in the rate of GST by 6% and revision in SoR due to increase in bitumen rate and labour cost. The State was asked to submit proper justification.
- (vi). The total cost and average cost of the proposed bridges have also increased to Rs. 5.96 lakh/m, when compared to proposal at Pre-EC Stage (Rs. 5.32 lakh/m). The State representative indicated that the increase in cost is mainly due to change in design of some of the bridges as per the advice of NRIDA/STA/PTA, besides increase in GST rate. The State was asked to furnish bridge-wise details and justification in an excel sheet, showing the components where the cost has increased.

3. Planning

(i) Trace Map Cut- Quality of roads

Trace Map rank	Number of proposals	%
1 to 15	204	73
16 to 50	54	19
51 to 100	16	6
>100	5	2
Total	279	-

(ii) Planning Audit (proposals)

- All 279 road Proposals and 35 LSB are uploaded on GEOSADAK.
- 110 samples road proposals were audited for their utility as TR/MRL under PMGSY-III by NRIDA Team.
- Location of all **35 LSBs** on PMGSY-III Proposals also checked on Geosadak.
- NRIDA received the compliance for the all 38 flagged proposals. State has dropped 04 unsatisfactory proposals and done the minor modification in the alignment for 04 proposals as per the comments of NRIDA.
- After Pre-Ec meeting, NRIDA audited 40 proposals which were found to be satisfactory.
- The Committee was informed that the State was asked to submit justification for 21 roads with Trace Map Rank higher than 50. The State in its response intimated that most of the proposals are connecting SH/NH and some are inter block/inter district connecting to other state. All 21 roads were checked by NRIDA in GeoSadak and 20 roads were found to be justifiable.

- As regards one road (Package No. RJ16P358- T05-Torda Kalan to Chandoli via Dudawas), which is terminating at damaged road, the State in its response intimated that due to district boundary and restricted district allotment, proposal can be extended upto district boundary with total length of 7.04 Km an remaining part upto MDR shall be taken up under state scheme in future. The State representative also added that the area between the terminal point of the proposed road and MDR (which is in Sikar district) is mainly forest and hill and that no useful purpose will be achieved in extending the road till MDR. The Committee acceded to the justification of the State Government.
- One (01) road T15-Dehra Mod to Veerampura via Mai-Jahangirpur-Gobra of 3.75 M carriageway width having PCI (in ch. Km 7/0 to 9/670) based on the traffic intensity is proposed to widen from 3.75 m to 5.50 m with projected T9 traffic. The State was advised to include the entire portion of the road, including the portion with good PCI in the current proposal, subject to condition that the additional cost for that portion beyond 3.75 m carriageway width shall be borne by the State Government itself.

4. Traffic wise details of road

- (i) In 3.75 m carriage width , 1 road of length 8 km is in T5 category with pavement cost of 38.89 lakh/km and average cost of 51.79 lakh/km.
- (ii) In 3.75 m carriage width, 4 roads of length 39.3 km are in T6 traffic category with pavement cost of 28.41 lakh/ km and average cost of 49.22 lakh/km.
- (iii) In 3.75 m carriageway width, 49 roads of length 408.465 km are in T7 traffic category with pavement cost of Rs. 34.32 lakh/km and average cost of Rs 49.46 lakh/Km.
- (iv) In 3.75 m carriageway width, 2 roads of length 13.2 km are in T8 traffic category with pavement cost of Rs. 38.65 lakh/km and average cost of Rs 48.84 lakh/Km.
- (v) In 3.75 m carriageway width, 46 roads of length 355.7 km are in T9 traffic category with pavement cost of Rs. 43.5 lakh/km and average cost of Rs 54.29 lakh/Km.
- (vi) In 5.50 m carriageway width, 1 road of length 5 km is in T4 traffic category with pavement cost of Rs. 43.54 lakh/km and average cost of Rs 50.21 lakh/Km.
- (vii) In 5.50 m carriageway width, 12 road of length 180.96 km are in T7 traffic category with pavement cost of Rs. 49.77 lakh/km and average cost of Rs 63.36 lakh/Km.
- (viii) In 5.50 m carriageway width, 1 road of length 6 km is in T8 traffic category with pavement cost of Rs. 45.42 lakh/km and average cost of Rs 55.28 lakh/Km.
- (ix) In 5.50 m carriageway width, 156 road of length 1,419.842 km are in T9 traffic category with pavement cost of Rs. 60.49 lakh/km and average cost of Rs 72.07 lakh/Km.
- (x) In 5.50 m carriageway width, 7 road of length 52.6 km are in IRC 37 traffic category with pavement cost of Rs. 69.90 lakh/km and average cost of Rs 79.89 lakh/Km.

5. PCU value

The PCU of 279 roads proposed in the current batch are as under:-

S.No	PCU/day	No of Roads	No of Roads
		3.75 m	5.5 m
1.	<500	12	-
2.	500-1000	15	-
3.	1000-1500	14	01
4.	1500-2000	33	08
5.	2000-2500	18	52
6.	2500-3000	08	38
7.	3000-3500	01	11
8.	3500-4000	-	09
9.	4000>	01	58
Total		102	177

In 3.75 m carriageway width, for 18 roads with PCU 2000-2500, the State was asked to consider widening of the roads to 5.50 m or alternatively make provisions for additional safety measures. For remaining 10 roads, with PCU 2500-3000 in 8 roads, 3000-3500 in 01 road and more than 4000 in 01 road, the State was asked to revise these proposals for widening to 5.50 m carriageway width, as these roads will not be safe with 3.75m CW.

In 5.50 m carriageway width, the State has proposed widening/upgradation of 09 roads with less than 2000 PCU. The State representative indicated that 7 out of these 9 roads had existing carriageway width of 5.50 m and other roads connect with State Highways and National Highways and therefore, 5.50 m carriageway width has been proposed. The Committee acceded to the justification subject to condition that the expenditure on widening /strengthening beyond 3.75 m carriageway width will be borne by the State Government, and amended as higher specification cost.

6. Distribution of roads based on Widening to various Carriageways

Categories of Upgradation	No.	Length (km)	Avg. Pavement Cost (Lakhs /KM)	Avg. Total Cost (Lakhs /KM)
3.75-3.75	90	733.69	37.52	51.19
3-3.75	12	90.98	42.86	54.38
5.5-5.5	31	297.76	58.52	69.31
3.75-5.5	115	1106.84	59.19	71.05
3-5.5	31	259.80	62.07	74.27
Total	279	2489.067	52.42	64.72

The State has proposed widening of 12 roads from 3.00 m carriageway width to 3.75 m carriageway width. The State was advised to examine PCU/traffic category of these roads and re-consider the proposal as widening from 3 to 3.75m is usually not done properly due to insufficient width.

7. Length wise proposal details

All the road works except one work included in the proposal are of 5 Km and above, as per the following details:

Sl.No	Items	No of roads	Length in km	Pavement cost crores	Pav Cost/km	Total cost in Crores	Average total cost/km
1	3 to 5 km	1	4	2.39	59.75	3.19	79.75
2	> 5 km	278	2485.067	1302.50	52.41	1607.64	64.69
	Total	279	2489.067	1304.89	52.42	1610.83	64.72

The average candidate road length is 14.56 Km and average proposed road length is 8.93 Km.

8. Existing surface details

The approximate length (in km) of the existing Surface of the roads proposed in the current batch, as intimated by the State representative during the meeting is as under:-

Brick soling	Track	Gravel	Moorum	WBM	BT	CC	Total
0	20.447	43.21	0.15	0.464	2,242.445	182.351	2,498.07

Out of 279 roads proposed in the current batch, in 263 roads 95% of the existing surface is BT/CC. In 4 road works the percentage of BT/CC is 85-95% and for 1 road the portion of BT/CC is 75-85%.

5 roads are having 50-75% portion as BT/CC while 3 roads have 25-50%. 3 roads have BT/CC portion less than 25%. The state is asked to furnish the justifications for 11 roads having Non-BT surface more than 25%. It was made clear to the State these roads shall be accepted only under exceptional circumstances based on the justification of the State relating to high utility or connecting major roads or highways etc, otherwise these roads need to be excluded from the proposal.

9. High Priority Roads Skipped in CUCPL

With regard to 810 road works of High Priority which have been skipped, State has furnished the following justifications:

- For 203 road works, the State is not interested in riding surface improvement,
- 180 road works have been constructed under state scheme and are under DLP,
- In case of 154 roads, proposable road length is less than 5 Km.
- 119 roads sanctioned under State Scheme but under construction
- 65 road works under PMGSY DLP
- 58 roads cannot be taken up due to land issues

- vii. In case of 10 roads, TR/MRL is a terminating link route and not permitted till all TR/MRL are saturated.
- viii. In case of 10 roads, ownership is with different department
- ix. 6 roads due to forest issues; and
- x. In case of 5 roads, eligible length already proposed under PMGSY-III

The State was asked to re-examine 154 roads which have been skipped on the ground that the proposable length is less than 5 Km and in case some of the roads are of high utility value, consider/include those roads either under the current proposal or include them in the next batch after deleting some (equal) length of proposals from this batch.

The implementation period for PMGSY-III is upto March, 2025. Therefore, the State was also advised to undertake detailed examination of 58 roads which have not been considered due to land issues and 10 roads, which have been left citing forest issues. There is sufficient time to resolve such issues.

10. Pavement cost/km wise details

The pavement cost of 279 roads proposed in the current batch is as under:-

Sl No	Pavement cost/km	No of roads	
		3.75 m	5.5
1	<50 Lakhs	99	13
2	50-55	01	20
3	55-60	01	54
4	60-65	01	55
5	65-70	01	27
6	70-75	-	06
7	75-80	-	02
	Total	102	177

2 roads under 3.75 m carriageway width category with pavement cost of more than Rs. 60.00 lakh/Km and 08 roads under 5.50 m carriageway width category with average cost more than Rs. 70.00 lakh/km need to re-examined by NRIDA.

11. Non-Pavement cost/km wise details

The Non-pavement cost of 279 roads proposed in the current batch is as under:-

Sl No	Non Pavement cost/km	No of roads	
		3.75 m	5.5 m
1	<20 Lakhs/km	91	157
2	20-25	06	13
3	25-30	04	04
4	30-35	01	01
5	35-40	-	02
	Total	102	177

The state was asked to furnish justification for all the 31 roads having Non-pavement cost of more than Rs. 20.00 lakh/Km.

12. R&D Proposals

The R&D proposal submitted by the State was found agreeable as per the following details:

Sl.No	Name of Technology	Vision 2022	Total Length (km)	Length proposed as per OMMAS (km)	Percentage as per OMMAS	Actual Length proposed by PIUs(As per SRRDA)
1.	Waste Plastic	70% length out of the eligible proposed length involving Hot Mix process	Hot Mix length	1535.321	70.62%	
			2174.07			
2.	Mechanized Surface Dressing	T-1 to T-5 (100%)	T1 to T5	11.8	100%	
			11.8			
		T-6 to T-8 (50%)	T6 to T8	244.35	41.37%	299.635 (50.73%)
			590.65			
3.	Cold Mix	25% of the eligible proposed Length	2174.07	0	0%	
4.	Panelled Cement Concrete/ White Topping	100 % proposed length under Cement Concrete.	315	133.36	59.68%	203.635 (64.65)
5.	Cell Filled Concrete			54.64		91.234 (28.96) (Total 93.61%)

13. Maintenance

State has proposed Rs. 8,929.45 lakh for 5 years Routine maintenance, which is 5.54% of the construction cost and agreeable. Similarly, for 6th year renewal cost is Rs. 27,705.69 lakh, which is 17.20% of the construction cost and agreeable.

14. Pending compliance of the State on previous clearances

i) The State has furnished 3rd Party Traffic Survey or Axle road survey and Road Safety Audit on Sample basis. **The State was asked to submit all the reports and not merely the sample reports.**

ii) Installation of GPS on Key machinery being used under PMGSY-III has not yet been implemented by the State. **The State was asked to expedite the same. It was made clear to State that the current sanction shall be issued only after full compliance of above instructions.**

15. Status of implementation of PMGSY-I, II and III

The State has already completed PMGSY-I & II, except for 1 bridge work under PMGSY-I. The status of PMGSY-I, II and III in the State is as under:-

Roads

Scheme	Sanctioned		Completed		Balance		Unawarded	
	Nos.	Length (Km)	Nos.	Length (Km)	No. of Roads	Length (km)	No. of Road	Length (km)
PMGSY III	614	5,852.41	536	5,495.15	78	307.89	5	45.89

Bridges

S.No	SCHEME	Sanction (Nos.)	Completed (Nos.)	Balance (Nos.)	Unawarded (Nos.)
1	PMGSY I	26	25	1	0
2	PMGSY II	6	6	0	0
3	PMGSY III	6	2	4	0
Total:		38	33	5	0

16. Physical progress during last year and current year as on (09.11.2022)

During the current year i.e. FY 2022-23, the state has been given target of 1,500 km and state has already completed 405 km road length.

17. Maintenance of roads under Defect Liability Period (DLP)

The Committee observed that the funds received for maintenance of roads under DLP has not been updated. The State was asked to update the same on OMMAS.

18. Renewal Length Status

The Committee observed that the status are not being updated on OMMAS. The State representative informed that the Renewal is being done by the other wing and assured that the status shall be updated on OMMAS on priority.

19. e-Marg

Under eMARG, 99 (7%) packages pending for locking, 127 (9%) packages are pending for MEE. Out of total 724 roads eligible for Routine Inspection during October, 2022, 156 roads (22%) missed Routine Inspection during October, 2022. 833 packages are pending for payment for more than 3 months (out of packages on which MEE done) and total 262 (31%) packages pending for first payment in eMARG. The Committee observed that that out of total expenditure of Rs. 44.21 crore incurred during the current year, only Rs. 9.05 crore (22%) has been incurred on bills having liability of FY 2022-23. The State was advised to saturate progress on e-Marg and ensure maintenance of all roads under DLP.

20. PMGSY-III Award analysis

Out of the awarded 609 works, 600 works are awarded below sanction amount and 9 works are awarded above sanctioned amount. 16 works have been awarded 0-6%

below, 34 works 6-12% below, 58 works 12-18% below, 98 works 18-24% below, 126 works 24-30% below and 268 work 30% below the Technical Sanctioned amount. The Director (P.III) was asked to carry out band-wise analysis of quality inspections done by the NQMs and SQMs. The State was asked to ensure additional visits of State Quality Monitors on the low quoted PMGSY works so that these works are completed with good quality, in terms of advisory dated 3rd March, 2022 issued by NRIDA.

21. Quality Control

I. 58 packages are presently in progress and lab for 1 package is not established.

II. The target for SQM inspections during 2022-23 is 2,607 against which only 757 inspections have been carried out so far. State was advised to speed up SQM inspection in order to meet the target.

III. Unsatisfactory % based on NQM inspections (November, 2019 - October, 2022)

- Completed Works - 0.58 % - 172 Completed works inspected
- Ongoing Works - 2.55% - 509 Ongoing works inspected
- Maintenance works - 6.22% - 209 Maintenance Works Inspected

IV. The Committee observed that U% for 6 bridge works inspected during November, 2019-October, 2022 is 16.67%. The State was asked to focus on quality of bridges.

V. Pending ATRs at State level-

- Total - 11 (Ongoing works-8, Completed works-03)

VI. U% in deficiency in QC register is as high as 47%. The State was asked to take immediate action for rectification of deficiency.

22. Status of complaints

Action Taken Report (ATR) in respect of two (03) complaints pertaining to irregularities in construction of works, etc., which forwarded to State in the month of November, 2021/May, 2022, are still awaited. The State was asked to expedite the same.

23. SQM Analysis :

It was noticed during the meeting that SQMs empanelled by the State have graded very few works 'Unsatisfactory' out of the large number of projects inspected by them. The State was advised to scrutinize and find out whether the performance of such SQMs satisfactory.

24. Financial Issues

- Non- Submission of Audited Balance Sheet of Maintenance fund for FY 2020-21.
- Interest amount of Rs. 57.84 crore is pending to recover from bank.

- 6 works pending for financial closure for more than 180 days as on 07.11.2022.
- State Share of Rs. 65.17 crore, corresponding to Central Share released to the State on 31st August, 2022 is still to be released. The State was asked to expedite the same.

25. Recommendations of Empowered Committee

Subject to the above observations and concurrent action/ compliance by the State Government as stipulated in the foregoing paras, the Empowered Committee recommended the above proposal as at para 2 above.

The meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to and from the Chair.
