

Government of India
Ministry of Rural Development
Department of Rural Development

KrishiBhavan, New Delhi
Dated the 18th March, 2021

Minutes

Sub: Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Committee to discuss the project proposals submitted by the State Government of Odisha under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III) for the 2020-21 (Batch-II)-reg.

A copy of the Minutes of the Meeting of the Empowered Committee held on 11th March, 2021 through Video Conferencing (VC Code:- 1325053) to consider the project proposals for Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III) is forwarded herewith for information and necessary action. The State Government is requested to furnish compliance on the observations of EC on priority.


(Devinder Kumar)
Director (RC)

Distribution:

- (i) The Principal Secretary, Rural Development Department, Government of Odisha, Bhubaneshwar-751001.
- (ii) The Chief Executive Officer, Odisha Rural Roads Development Agency, Bhubaneshwar.
- (iii) The Chief Engineer, Odisha Rural Roads Development Agency, Bhubaneshwar.
- (iv) The Adviser (RD), NITI Aayog, NITI Aayog Bhavan, Sansad Marg, New Delhi.
- (v) The Director, Central Roads Research Institute, Mathura Road, New Delhi.
- (vi) The Secretary General, Indian Road Congress, Kama Koti Marg, Ranjit Nagar, Sector-6, Rama Krishna Puram, New Delhi-110037
- (vii) The Chief Engineer, Ministry of Road Transport & Highways, Parivahan Bhavan, New Delhi.
- (viii) The Secretary, Department of Agriculture, Cooperation and Farmer's Welfare, Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers' Welfare, Krishi Bhavan, New Delhi, with the request to nominate an officer dealing with the Agricultural Produce and Live Stock Marketing (Promotion and Facilitation) Model Act, 2017 for the meeting.
- (ix) All Directors in National Rural Infrastructure Development Agency (NRIDA), 15 NBCC Tower, 5th Floor, Bhikaji Cama Place, New Delhi-110001.

Copy for information to:-

PS to Hon'ble MRD/PS to Hon'ble MoS (RD)/PS to Secretary (RD)/PPS to AS (RD)/PPS to AS & FA/PPS to JS (RC)

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EMPOWERED COMMITTEE HELD ON 11th MARCH, 2021 TO CONSIDER THE PROJECT PROPOSALS OF PMGSY-III SUBMITTED BY GOVERNMENT OF ODISHA UNDER PMGSY-III (BATCH-II, 2020-21)

A Meeting of the Empowered Committee was held through video conference on 11th March, 2021 at 11:00 AM under the chairmanship of Secretary (RD) to consider the project proposals submitted by the State of Odisha under Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana-III (PMGSY-III, Batch-II, 2020-21). Following officials were present in the meeting:

Shri Nagendra Nath Sinha	Secretary (RD)
Smt. Alka Upadhyaya	Addl. Secretary (RD)
Dr Ashish Kumar Goel	Joint Secretary (RC), MoRD & DG, NRIDA
Shri Devinder Kumar	Director (RC), MoRD
Shri. B C Pradhan	Consultant (Tech), NRIDA
Shri Deepak Ashish Kaul	Director (F&A), NRIDA
Dr. I.K.Pateriya	Director (P.II&III), NRIDA
Shri Pradeep Agarwal	Director (P.I), NRIDA
State Govt. Representatives	
Shri Pradip Kumar Jena,	ACS, RD
Shri Sudarshan Parida	CEO, Odisha SRRDA
Shri A.K. Pradhan	Chief Engineer, Odisha SRRDA
Shri Sudhir Kumar Tripathy	SQC, Odisha SRRDA
Shri A.K.Mishra	ITNO, Odisha SRRDA

2. Details of Proposal:

Item	As per Pre EC dated 22.02.2021				As per OMMAS dated 09.03.2021			
	No	Length (in km/m)	Cost (Rs in Crores)	Avg. Cost per km/m (Lakhs)	No	Length (in km/m)	Cost (Rs in Crores)	Avg. Cost per km/m (Lakhs)
Roads	557	3,477.21	2,047.37	58.88	543	3,433.56	1,947.09	56.71
LSBs	39	2,360.57	149.74	6.34	77	4,529.82	281.47	6.21
Total	557 roads 39 LSBs	3,477.21 km roads 2,360.57 m LSBs	2,197.11*		543 roads 77 LSBs	3,433.56 km roads 4,529.82 m LSBs	2,228.55*	
*MoRD Share: Rs. 1,232.18 Crore State share : Rs. 996.37 Crore Target : 9,400 km Sanctioned : 3,327.50 km								

- (i) 3.75 m width road- 416 Nos & Length -2,533.13 km - Rs. 50.21 Lakhs/km
5.50 m width road - 127 Nos & Length- 900.43 km - Rs. 74.98 Lakhs/km

- (ii) All proposals have been scrutinized by STAs. PTA has scrutinised 81 roads on OMMAS. State should verify RQI length of 786.84 km and update it on OMMAS.

(iii) State has proposed Rs. 3.27 lakhs/km for 3.75 m width roads and Rs. 8.70 Lakhs/km for 5.50 m width roads under higher specification (to be borne by the state). Over all contribution towards higher specification is 4.70 Lakhs/km. Hence over all construction cost borne by PMGSY is Rs 52.01 Lakhs/km.

(iv) The State Government of Odisha has been allocated a road length 9,400 km under PMGSY-III. The first batch of proposals of 494 roads of 3,327.50 km and 4 Bridges of 174.84 m have been sanctioned to the State for Rs 1,996.23 crore (Central Share Rs 1,097.52 crore and State Share Rs 898.71 crore). The State has now submitted proposals for 543 roads of length 3433.56km and 77 LSBs of length 4529.82 m. Out of 543 roads, 416 roads of 2,533.13 km road length has been proposed with 3.75 m carriageway width and 127 roads of 900.43 km road length has been proposed with carriageway width of 5.50 m. It is seen that the State has increased no of LSBs from 39 during Pre EC to 77 during EC within a short period of 20 days. State should give proper justification of this increase in number of LSBs. Suitable number of these are DPRs need to be securitized by PTA as well.

3. Traffic wise details of road

- i. In 3.75 m carriageway width, 213 roads of length 1311.02 km are in T5 category with average cost Rs 50.90 lakhs/km (average pavement cost Rs. 35.15 lakh/Km).
- ii. In 3.75 m carriageway width, 202 roads of length 1209.71 km are in T6&T7 category with average cost Rs 49.42 lakhs/Km (average pavement cost Rs.34.25 lakh/Km).
- iii. In 5.50 m carriageway width, 05 roads of length 30.35 km are in T6&T7 category with average cost Rs 72.95 lakhs/Km (average pavement cost Rs. 60.76 lakh/Km).
- iv. In 3.75 m carriageway width, 01 road of length 12.40 km is in T8 category with average cost Rs 54.44 lakhs/Km (average pavement cost Rs. 32.34 lakh/Km).
- v. In 5.50 m carriageway width, 02 roads of length 17.20 km are in T8 category with average cost Rs 63.43 lakhs/Km (average pavement cost Rs. 52.73 lakh/Km).
- vi. In 5.50 m carriageway width, 120 roads of length 852.88 km are in T9 category with average cost Rs 75.28 lakhs/Km (average pavement cost Rs. 57.66 lakh/Km).

It was pointed out that cost of pavement in T6&T7 category is 60.76 lakh/km whereas for T8 and T9 category of roads, cost is 52.73 lakh/km and 57.66 lakhs/km. It was further mentioned that there is gap of 9.50 lakhs/km among these categories of roads. NRIDA was asked to get district wise picture to have more clarity on the issue. State should forward detailed justification in variation in cost district wise in a tabular form.

The length-wise proposal

(i) Out of 543 roads, 179 roads are 3 to 5 Km in length with average cost Rs 55.39 lakhs/Km, 364 roads more than 5 Km in length with average cost Rs 57.05 lakhs/Km. State has intimated that average length of candidate road is 9.53 Km and average proposed road length is 6.32 km.

(ii) Out of the total proposal of 3433.56 Km of roads, 170.45 km is from track level, 1090.36 km from Gravel level, 26.84 km from WBM level, 1482.68 km are BT & 663.23 Km are CC roads.

It was queried whether these track/gravel roads are part of core network and how these roads are eligible to be considered in PMGSY-III. ACS (RD), Odisha informed that these roads are eligible to be considered under

PMGSY norms because those habitations are considered connected through gravel/WBM road as per census 2001. NRIDA should cross check.

It was also queried that whether these roads are constructed under PMGSY or under any other scheme, and whether the design life of these roads are over and if these were on priority list. Only if these were answered in affirmative, these roads should be considered. Secretary (RD) directed that NRIDA should detail a team to Odisha and examine these roads whether they qualify to be considered under PMGSY-III.

(iv) Average cost of road in few districts like Boudh, Kendrapara, Nayagarh, Rayagada etc. is higher as compared to other districts and previous sanctions. State is requested to examine this high cost and provide road wise justification.

Trace Map Quality

Min. Trace Map Rank	Numbers of Proposals	%
1 to 15	399	73%
16 to 50	120	22%
51 to 100	23	4.24%
> 100	1	0.1%
Total	543	

95% of roads have been proposed from higher trace map rank. *Reasons for selecting 24 roads with low trace map rank road-wise, alignment map of all these 24 roads and its UV with detailed justification are required from the State. NRIDA should scrutinize all these roads of low trace map ranks through GEOSADAK as well.*

4. Planning

- i. 04 blocks had unsatisfactory habitation mapping leading to wrong priorities in CUCPL. These blocks are Deogaon, Digapahandi, Hingilicut and Kudumuluguma. In reply, ACS (RD), Odisha informed that three blocks have been rectified and are good from planning perspective. However, there may be some variation in Kudumuluguma block, being Naxal affected area. He assured to get the data rechecked for this block.

5. DPR Issues

- i. State should provide a copy of SLSC approval, MP-I, MP-II and MP-III formats and consent letters of Hon'ble MPs on final proposal as per latest advisory issued by MoRD on 02 Jun 2020. This action should be accomplished now so as to save time in sanction of these proposals.
- ii. State should certify that the roads proposed in current batch are not PMGSY roads which are under design life.
- iii. State needs to ensure that the required land width is available to provide 7.50 m and 9 m top width for 3.75 m & 5.50m carriageway as per IRC guidelines. Further, State should ensure that the existing CDs are widened to 9 m width for 5.50 m width roads.
- iv. 3rd party traffic verification as per recent advisory should be done by the State for design traffic considered more than 1 MSA and the reports should be attached with the

DPRs. Sample Third party traffic verification reports submitted by the State. Axle load test data and ATCC data to be provided for sample verification.

- v. State should ensure that the design stage RSA has been done for all the proposed candidate roads and the reports should be attached with the DPRs. Sample reports provided by the State for verification.
- vi. State should propose Surface dressing where the roads designed with T5 and below traffic category as per design chart and Clause 7.3.3 of IRC:SP:72:2015. After discussion, the State assured that they will propose adequate length under surface dressing.
- vii. Joint Inspection report of bridge sites to be provided by the State.

6. Maintenance

(i) The State has proposed a 5-year routine maintenance cost of Rs. 144.20 crore which is 7.40% of construction cost and Rs 503.1515 crore which is 25.84% of construction cost for 6th year renewal cost. However, the State was advised that the 6th year renewal cost should be accompanied by a post 5-year guarantee/maintenance period, and such cost should be a part of DPR.

(ii) Two physical copies of the MoU signed by the Competent Authority on each page of the document should be sent to the Ministry at the earliest.

7. e-Marg

Out of 3685 total workable packages, 85% packages have been locked, 82% contractors have been registered so far and payment using e-marg has been done in 11% packages. State is advised to expedite payment on remaining packages, as there are still 73% roads with zero expenditure.

8. R&D Technology

Sl No	Description	Minimum length to be proposed in km	Length proposed in km	Percentage of R&D roads with respect to total length
1	Technology with IRC Specification (Main streaming of Technology) - 10%	343.36		
	Waste Plastic and Cold Mix		993.69	28.94%
	Other mainstreaming technology		23.46	0.68%
	Total (a)+(b)		1,017.15	29.62%
2.	Technology with IRC Accreditation - 5%	171.68	712.25	20.74%
Total			1,729.40	50.36%

Although, 29.62% of total road length has been proposed using mainstream technology, against minimum requirement of 10% but most of it is under waste plastic and cold mix technology. The State was advised to propose adequate length under surface dressing, white topping, cell filled concrete, etc. 12.35% of road length has been proposed by using IRC accredited technology against minimum requirement of 5%. Choice of technology should be strictly as per the requirement of the location. The

State was further asked to propose Coir Technology to achieve the target length of 470 km as per Director (P-II) letter dated 23.04.2020. State had informed earlier that Coir Technology would be proposed in coastal districts. However, now State has proposed only 5.49 km, which is not acceptable.

It was informed that state should use Coir Technology on a larger scale. He told that Odisha being coastal State, coir would be available in abundance in the state and would create employment opportunities.

9. Maintenance of roads under DLP

SRRDA has utilized Rs. 287.97 crore against its maintenance liability of last 5 years of Rs. 497.28 crore which comes around 57.91%, whereas 1300.01 crore has reportedly been credited in the SRRDA account in the same period. During 2020-21, against the liability of Rs. 141.91 crore, Rs 73.14 crore has been spent. The State is requested to correct this data on OMMAS. State has also not updated renewal data on OMMAS. *It has been communicated vide Ministry's letter dt 12th January, 2021 that for fund release only such proposals which are compliant to para 19.3 (vi) of the programme guidelines shall be considered for release of the 2nd instalment of programme funds. Therefore, state should timely release and spend funds for maintenance of roads.*

10. Progress of PMGSY works

TYPE OF WORK-ROADS

S.No	SCHEME	SANCTIONED		COMPLETED		BALANCE ROAD LENGTH (Km)	UNAWARDED BALANCE LENGTH (Km)/Roads
		Nos.	LENGTH (Km)	Nos.	LENGTH (Km)		
1	PMGSY I	15,834	61,162.78	15,289	58,147.79	675.66 (545 Nos.)	40.05 (9 Nos.)
2	PMGSY II	636	3,672.38	380	3,504.70	157.50 (256 Nos.)	4.77 (1 No.)
3	PMGSY III	494	3,327.50	0	0.00	3,327.50 (494 Nos.)	1,788.66 (268 Nos.)
4	RCPLWEA	48	485.85	17	226.35	259.01 (31 Nos.)	-
Total:		17,012	68,648.530	15,686	61,878.850	4,419.68 (1,326 Nos.)	1,833.48 (278 Nos.)

TYPE OF WORK-LSBs

S.No	SCHEME	SANCTION (Nos.)	COMPLETED (Nos.)	Balance (Nos.)	Unaward (Nos.)
1	PMGSY I	530	394	136	1
2	PMGSY II	30	10	20	0
3	PMGSY III	4	-	4	1
4	RCPLWEA	2	-	2	0
Total:		566	404	162	2

Total 1326 no of road works of length 4419.68 km and 162 Nos of LSBs are pending with the state to complete. State should expedite the progress of these balance works.

11. Quality.

Out of 1141 ongoing packages, lab has not been established for 226 packages. Photographs of the labs are to be uploaded even if these are mobile labs. Further, 27 works have not been inspected by SQM even once, out of these 18 works are more than 12 months old. State has 74 active SQMs against the total requirement of 178. State should empanel more number of SQMs or go for hiring of agencies so that more number of works can be inspected. 36 ATRs of NQM observations in respect of completed works and 127 ATRs of ongoing works are pending with the State. Unsatisfactory grading is 8.50% for completed works, 6.99 % for ongoing works and 25.25% for maintenance works. Various anomalies in respect of SQM inspection have been seen which area as follows:

- Logo board is in different colour which is against the norms of the PMGSY road work. This aspect should be immediately looked into and advised state to take immediate corrective action.
- No protection work has been made for cross drainage in one of the completed work, which is highly accidental prone, still given Satisfactory by SQM.
- In one of the completed road shoulders are not at all maintained, this is the case of high embankment and no slow protection can be seen which is against the norms.
- Circular pit has been excavated in one of the road which is against the norms.
- Laboratory condition is very poor in one of the road, nothing is visible, no proper equipment.
- In one of the road, the work has been done till base course (WBM -III) level still the condition of shoulder is very poor. No compaction has been done and no FDD test has been conducted on shoulder.

It was agreed that the SQMs should be suitably sensitised both by the SRRDA & NRRDA in this regard, and those not improving would be replaced.

12. Financial Issues

(i) Financial closure of 51 physically completed work are pending with the State for more than six months. The State was asked to take immediate action and expedite pending financial closure of completed works. State has an unspent balance of Rs 1104.74 crore and utilization percentage is only 51.97%.

(ii) Expired Bank Guarantee of Rs 0.38 crore, pending stale cheque of Rs. 23.46 crore under programme fund, 0.15 crore under admin fund and 3.30 crore under maintenance fund are the pending financial issues with the State of Odisha. State has to take immediate action on all these issues.

13. Subject to the above observations and concurrent action/compliance by the State Government as stipulated in the foregoing paras, the Empowered Committee recommended the above proposals as at Para-2 above.

The meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to and from the Chair.
